Committees:	Dates:
Barbican Estate Residents Consultation Committee (RCC)	
Barbican Residential Committee(BRC)	24/11/2014
Community and Children's Services Committee (CCS)	08/12/2014
Projects Sub	
	12/12/2014
	21/01/2014
Subject:	
Water System Testing and Associated Safety Works at the	Public
Barbican and the HRA Estates Gateway 3/4 - Options	
Appraisal	
Report of:	For Information – RCC
Director of Community & Children's Services	For Decision – BRC,
	CCS and Projects Sub

<u>Summary</u> Project Status Green Time Line **Overall programme:** 5 year programme - 2015/16 – 2019/20 Key dates: Procurement for assessment/testing contractor- completed March 2015. First works commence – April 2015. Programme works in for following 5 years – April 2015-March 2020. Pending Approval of Gateway 3/4 – Options Appraisal Programme status Latest estimated £2-2.5m (should a 3-5 year programme be procured) cost of works N/A. Expenditure to date

Progress to Date:

No expenditure has been incurred. An initial planning exercise has been carried out to map out the necessary procurement process. No change to previous gateway.

Overview of options:

There are two options. Option 1 is proceeding with the previous approach of procuring on an annual basis; this approach has been effective to date. Option 2 is to build-upon the previous approach by procuring for a 3-5 year programme of works. Option 2 is recommended.

Procurement Approach:

The procurement approach will be similar for either a 1-year or 3-5-year programme. The tenders will be advertised on the London Portal.

Current Estimate of Costs:

	-	-
Description	Option 1: annual one-off	Option 2: 3-5 year
-	procurement	programme (inc. major
		works)
Works Costs	£110,000	£2-2.5m
Fees & Staff	£13,750	£250,000 - £312,500
Costs		
Total	£123,750	£2,250,000 - £2,812,500
Funding Strategy		
Source	City Fund	City Fund

Recommendations

- Approval is given to proceed with procurement for a contractor to undertake the programme of testing, including major works.
- Approval of the estimated budget of up to £2.5m for a 5 year programme of testing and works.

Options Appraisal Matrix

See attached.

Contact

Report Author	Amy Carter, Asset Programme Manager	
Email Address	Amy.Carter@cityoflondon.gov.uk	
Telephone Number	0207 332 3768	

Options Appraisal Matrix

		Option 1 - reactive	Option 2 – planned programme inc. major works
1.	Brief description	Assess and test the assets on an annual basis, in accordance with statutory requirement, undertaking repair works in a reactive fashion.	Undertake a programme of assessments and testing, in accordance with statutory requirement, building a schedule of planned works on a hierarchical basis starting with the highest risks identified.
2.	Scope and exclusions	Scope: The project applies to residential accommodation at the Barbican Estate and all the HRA Estates (Avondale Square, Dron House, Golden Lane, Holloway, Middlesex Street, Southwark, Sydenham Hill, York Way, William Blake, Windsor House).	
		Exclusions: internal equipment e.g. shower heads and taps within flats which are the responsibility of the resident.	
Pre	oject Planning		
3.	Programme and	Overall programme: annual rolling.	Overall programme: 5 years - 2015/16-2019/20
	key dates	Key dates: Procurement for assessment/testing contractor– completed March 2015. Works commence – April 2015. Works complete – March 2016	Key dates: Procurement for assessment/testing contractor– completed March 2015. First works commence – April 2015. 5 year works programme April 2015 – March 2020.
		Other works dates to coordinate: The programme will have regard to other projects that affect the estates.	Other works dates to coordinate: The programme will have regard to other projects that affect the estates.
4.	Risk implications	Overall project risk: Green Health and Safety of residents and staff is compromised if assessments, testing and any associated works are not carried out in a timely fashion. However, under both options, statutory compliance is achieved.	
5.	Benefits and disbenefits	 Benefits: Statutory compliance is achieved. Disbenefits: Higher cost by operating annually. 	 Benefits: Statutory compliance is achieved. Lower cost by establishing a planned programme. High risk aspects of the systems are

		Option 1 - reactive	Option 2 – planned programme inc. major works
		 High risk aspects of the systems are not programmed for removal, continuing to require the management of these risks and incur testing costs. 	programmed for removal, reducing both future risks and testing costs.
6. Stakeholders and Residents, including leaseholders through Section 20 where they stand to incur service charges.		ere they stand to incur service charges.	
	consultees	Departments of City Surveyor's, Comptroller and City Solicitor, Town Clerks and Chamberlain's (including CLPS	
	source plications		
7.	Total Estimated	Annual amount:	£2 - £2.5m
	cost	£50,000 - £60,000 on the Barbican Estate.	The early estimate is that the spend split will be 60%
		£60,000 - £70,000 on the HRA Estates.	Barbican Residential Estate and 40% HRA estates; however this is subject to confirmation as the more detailed programme of works is developed.
8.	Funding strategy	The HRA estates: The project is funded by the Housing Revenue Account (HRA), which includes service charge recovery from leaseholders. The amount by estate varies dependent upon proportions of leaseholders.	
		e Barbican Residential Estate: e project is funded by the City Fund; the majority of cost (95%) is recoverable by way of service charges from aseholders.	
9.	Estimated capital value/return	N/A.	
10.	Ongoing revenue implications	Ongoing revenue implications will remain unchanged, with assessments, testing and reactive works completed on an annual basis.	Ongoing revenue implications will be reduced as the higher risk systems are subject to major works which will lower the outstanding risk, and therefore lower the required amount of monitoring.
11.	Investment appraisal	N/A.	

	Option 1 - reactive	Option 2 – planned programme inc. major works
12. Affordability	The works have been factored into the Asset Management plans for the Barbican Estate.	The works have been factored into the Asset Management plans for the Barbican Estate, the programmed approach is considered more cost- effective.
13. Procurement strategy	Tenderers will be asked to submit costing for initial assessments and testing for a one year contract, and a schedule of rates for a list of standard works where these works are required to be carried out immediately.	Tenderers will be asked to submit costing for initial assessments and testing for a three year contract, and a schedule of rates for a list of standard works where these works are required to be carried out immediately. Tenderers will also make recommendations, dependent upon the outcomes of the assessments and testing, for further works – the full works requirements will be in the scope of the procurement.
14. Legal implications	Water systems that include tanks or areas that are not regularly flushed with running water pose a risk of harbouring bacteria. There could be legal consequences where failure to monitor and maintain equipment has caused exposure to bacteria and led to illness.	
15. Corporate property implications	It is important that the City's assets remain in good, safe and statutory compliant condition. Therefore all necessary action should be taken to ensure that assets are kept as such throughout the assets' lifetime.	
16. Traffic implications	N/A.	
17. Sustainability and energy implications	Should pipework be replaced or re-configured this may improve water flow rates with a marginal reduction in pumping requirements and therefore energy. However, the work may also involve tasks such as adjusting settings on hot water equipment to achieve higher temperatures for safe storage. A consequence may be higher energy usage.	
18. IS implications	N/A.	
19. Equality Impact Assessment	N/A.	

	Option 1 - reactive	Option 2 – planned programme inc. major works
20. <u>Recommendation</u>	Not recommended	Recommended
21. Next Gateway	Gateway 5 - Authority to Start Work	Gateway 5 - Authority to Start Work
22. Resource requirements to reach next Gateway	£2,000 staff costs.	£8,000 staff costs.